

Weaknesses of policy making in Iran to reduce the rate of departure of elites from the country

Radoslaw Fiedler¹, Ellias Aghili Dehnavi²

ABSTRACT

In this policy paper, the factors affecting the migration of Iranian elites were first investigated, which are political, economic, social factors, globalization of work, organizational and administrative factors, lack of respect and dignity of elites, lack of hierarchy and elitism, and the presence of attraction. Different factors were identified as the most important factors in countries receiving immigrants. One of the most important weaknesses of the policy in Iran for the departure of the elites is limited financial support, which is not enough to encourage the elites to stay inside the country. Granting conscription facilities does not include half of the target society, namely women, and on the other hand, not only does it not help to prevent elites from leaving the country, but it also facilitates this process. The lack of meritocracy, formal invitations, and the lack of recruiting elites in universities is another weakness in the existing policies. Focusing too much on individualism in dealing with elites and supporting them, paying money instead of providing facilities such as laboratories, and the problems of supporting projects in identifying and evaluating projects, as well as the way of awarding points are also other weaknesses. It is the most important policy in preventing elites from leaving the country. Improving economic conditions and developing specialized capacities and providing cultural, economic, welfare, political, managerial, legal, technical and ethical infrastructures is a fundamental policy that must be pursued by responsible institutions to solve the problem of elite immigration. Maintaining and enhancing the dignity of the elites, restoring and rebuilding the atmosphere of trust between the elites, society and the government, creating an effective demand and market for the services of the elites, developing the consumption and application of science, the independence of scientific institutions, and examples mainly related to the non-material aspect of attracting the elites are also worthy of more attention.

KEYWORDS: elites, immigration, policy weaknesses, managerial weaknesses, economic and political problems.

1. INTRODUCTION

The elites are human capitals, whose existence cause balance in the society and the main factor of the country's growth and development. When a society is depleted of elites, in addition to stopping the development process, the stability of the society is also endangered. Our country, like many developing countries, is facing many problems in cultivating and maintaining expert personnel, and the process of emigration of experts and elites to developed countries has been relatively accelerated in the last few years. Unfortunately, today we are in a situation where every talented person who has the opportunity to migrate considers it better to leave than to stay. A large number of academic elites at the university and even secondary level are looking for immigration. At the same time, the issue of the immigration of doctors has become a serious problem for the society and the country's health system. The cultural, artistic and sports elites are not in a more favorable situation. Like a building that may not seem to have a problem but is rotten from the inside. if this amount of elite immigration continues, the country will soon lack a skilled workforce with expert opinion, which is not wrong if we say that this is the most important and worst damage and blow to any country.

¹ Full Professor at Adam Mickiewicz University, Faculty of Political Science and Journalism, Poznan, Poland, radoslaw.fiedler@amu.edu.pl ORCID: 0000-0003-1573-9898

² Ph.D. candidate at Adam Mickiewicz university, Faculty of Political Science and Journalism, Poznan, Poland, ellagh@amu.edu.pl <https://orcid.org/0009-0001-9238-056X>

2. EFFECTIVE FACTORS

In order to solve the problem of the high rate of elites leaving the country, the first step is to identify the factors and roots of this problem and the motivations of the elites to emigrate. Many factors are involved in creating and intensifying this problem and are effective, which will be introduced in this section.

2. 1. Economic factors

One of the most important factors that play a role in increasing the departure of elites from the country are economic factors. Following the economic sanctions against the country, the incompetence of the officials, their inability to return stability to the economy and the subsequent devaluation of the national currency a wave of despair has been created among the youth, including the country's elites. This is the main reason is the increase in the immigration rate of these people.

Regarding the importance of economic factors in the rate of elite migration, it is enough to pay attention to the fact that whenever the economic conditions in the country face a crisis, the rate of these migrations has increased. On the other hand, the favorable economic conditions of other countries, especially the United States, Canada and European countries, also play a role in motivating the elites to migrate (Bozorg zadeh et al., 2019).

2. 2. Organizational and administrative factors

The lack of meritocracy in granting various opportunities, including job opportunities, is one of the effective factors in the migration of elites. In a country that is full of elite and talented young people in all fields of study, it is regrettable that a person with a diploma is assigned to important and key positions such as governor, mayor, member of parliament and sometimes more sensitive positions. Naturally, living in such a situation causes disillusionment among young people and increases their motivation to migrate. Moreover, occupational and educational pressures can also be considered as another effective factors on the formation of the motivation of elites to migrate. For example, the various pressures that are put on students during their studies by the university, professors, etc. can be counted among these cases. In addition, the nepotism instead of rules and regulations in the management of elites is also among the organizational and administrative factors affecting the migration of elites. The lack of transparency of existing laws in the field of recruiting and recruiting elites, the formality and unrealistic nature of some calls to recruit these people, are also effective administrative and organizational factors in increasing the motivation of elites to leave their homeland (Bozorg zadeh, 1401).

2. 3. Political factors

The impossibility of continuous communication with scientific centers abroad, the lack of attention to the sending of academic board members to educational courses abroad and the lack of short-term scholarships are among the important political factors affecting the increase of elites leaving the country. In addition, Iran's dispute and conflict with some European countries and the United States and the unresolved problems related to nuclear negotiations have increased the fear of imposing more sanctions. as a result, it caused increased security problems among the elites. The failure to make appropriate and effective decisions and policies in the field of improving the status of universities and the repetition of these policies in different governments in Iran shows that despite stated the opinions of the officials, the issue of science is not one of their main concerns. This is also one of the important and effective factors in increasing the rate of departure of elites from the country. Iran's relationship with some countries, including Israel, has caused problems for some sports elites. Some of them did not have the possibility to face Israeli athletes. they immigrated by accepting the nationality of other countries in order to be able to participate in international sports competitions due to this reason (Bagheri et al., 2019). The existence of different views that exist on the side of the government and the government on a specific issue and the lack of stability in cultural and social policymaking put the people in culture, art, sports and also the scientific elite in an undecided situation. These are other important factors originating from politics and the country's big problems that have led to the mass migration of elites. Sudden and unsupported decisions made by politicians and policy makers is other factor. It creates many restrictions for elites. For example, the security plans to limit the Internet can be seen as taking away many opportunities from the people of this country especially the elites. This along with many other similar policies is not ineffective in the departure of the elites from the country.

A simple survey shows that except for a few weak and isolated countries such as North Korea, other countries are seeking to increase the speed of the Internet and provide better services to the people, but in Iran, instead of providing a plan to protect the national wealth and confronting with embezzlement, the plan to protect the national identity, the plan to protect the value of the national currency, such decisions are taken. This is due to have political issues and prevent transparency, exposure and publicizing of the endless mistakes of various officials through social networks. This can make the activities of elites face serious challenges. In such an atmosphere where the

elites do not have psychological security to ensure the possibility of continuing their activities in the country. Consequently, the decision to migrate increases among them (Malekshahi et al., 1400).

2. 4. Social factors

The increase in the level of delinquency and the occurrence of various crimes such as theft, especially after the intensification of economic problems, has caused a decrease in the level of mental security in the community. This factor can provide motivations for migration in people who have the possibility to leave the country, and the elites are also considered as part of this group. For example, during the last few years, we have witnessed the departure of many scientific, cultural, artistic and sports elites due to these reasons. The existence of some social restrictions due to culture, religion or other factors in Iran can also affect the decision of some elites to migrate. In addition, according to published international statistics, Iranian people are considered one of the saddest or, in other words, the unhappiest people in the world, which can also lead to an increase in the rate of emigration of elites. The lack of access or access to low speed and restricted Internet and the presence of high filtering can also be seen as effective factors in increasing the rate of elite migration (Esmailzadeh and Salehi, 2015).

2. 5. Failure to respect the dignity of the elite

Another important and effective factor in the increase in the migration rate of the elites is the lack of respect for their dignity. The elites, especially the scientific elites have not had the opportunity to earn money for many years due to their education, and they at young age face a situation where even if they find a job, their income is so low that they cannot support themselves in any way. On the other hand, People of the same age who are not only not educated, but also have not learned any other special skills in life, but they entered the labor market earlier. Just consider in some cases, some officials have gone further and accused the elites of lacking skills. In general, the change of social values and the fact that money is considered more valuable than science and art results in not respecting the dignity of the elites, which played a significant role in their migration. Many elites leave the country, for they feel that they cannot be influential, or they feel that they are not being played. This means that even the financial and welfare motives may not be in the first line of the experts' and elites' wishes, and if they feel that they are being played, they come to the conclusion that something called national interests is predicted and implemented in the heavy bureaucracy of attracting experts and elites. The story of these damaging migrations is adjusted (Azadi et al., 2020).

2. 6. Lack of merit and specialization

Unfortunately, the lack of meritocracy in organizations and departments is quite evident. Lack of specialization refers to the phenomenon that some managers are appointed to managerial positions regardless of their expertise, knowledge and experience. In turn, in the appointment of middle and operational managers of their respective organizations, they choose weaker and less specialized people, which continues to the management levels at lower levels. Isolation has been carried out, and the senior manager in order not to be questioned and shadowed by skilled people does not appoint them to management positions, which causes the frustration of skilled people and ultimately leads to the migration or desertion of skilled people.

when they are attracted to the destinations, the economic and social benefits will be among the first privileges that will be given to them. at the same time, they will be placed in a suitable scientific and research position, which is one of the first needs of this group (Sadeghi Nejad et al., 2018).

2. 7. The phenomenon of labor globalization

If we define globalization as the expansion of social relations to the global level in various cultural, political and economic dimensions, then we can understand the globalization of the labor market as the formation of a global labor market, in which the fields and facilities necessary for access and easy communication has been provided between labor supply and demand. Therefore, the globalization of the labor market provides the basis for the migration of specialists. This, along with the lack of suitable and sufficient jobs for Iranian elites, has caused an increase in their emigration from the country (Shaabani et al., 2021).

2. 8. Existence of various attractions in countries receiving immigrants

Along with the existence of many problems in Iran, the existence of many attractions in destined countries is also effective in increasing the number of elites who decide to emigrate. Among these attractions are favorable economic conditions, the existence of favorable medical and welfare services, suitable weather, respect for human dignity, social freedoms, favorable educational conditions, high security, significant tourist attractions, a higher welfare level, and many job opportunities, etc. (Wahbi, 2016).

3. WEAKNESSES OF POLICIES TO REDUCE THE DEPARTURE OF ELITES

One of the policies adopted by the officials of the Ministry of Science, the National Foundation of Elites and other relevant institutions to support the elites in order to reduce the rate of their departure from the country is policies based on financial support. This policy is giving financial support to a number of the best students of the country and universities in the form of different plans for each class. Although at first glance, this policy seems to be an effective means to encourage elites to work inside the country and prevent them from migrating, the structural weaknesses of this plan have actually reduced its effectiveness to a great extent. The most important weakness of this plan is the very limited amount of resources allocated to this work. It is obvious given the country's increasing inflation in recent years, such limited support and small amounts given to students in the form of these plans cannot satisfy the country's elites or even respond to a part of their needs. It must be bear in mind that the elites have spent many years acquiring science and knowledge and most of them did not have any source of income during the education process Now that they have reached a young age in a very simple comparison with young people of their age who either have a much lower level of education or their education is at the elementary level. But their difference with elites is that they entered the job market during their adolescence or youth or have learned a profession and currently have significant incomes. Therefore, Elites get frustrated. They gradually are not in the suitable age for marriage due to not having enough financial power to start a family, and in such a situation, they do not consider the small financial support granted for their valuable scientific work to be a solution. If policies based on financial support are supposed to be an incentive to prevent the departure of the elites, firstly these supports should cover all the country's elites in various fields. Secondly, its amount should be enough to meet at least part of the needs of the youth. The current allocated budget is in no way proportionate and worthy of the elites of the country. Giving these elites the opportunity to express and emerge the skills and capabilities of this segment of the society is the best reward that can have positive effects for the society and the elites themselves.

In fact, they should be given opportunities and facilities that they can use to earn money because of their skills and abilities. These people themselves can be the foundation of wealth production, rather than limiting them to receive small amounts of money under the title of bonus or award and expecting that in return for receiving these awards, they will have exceptional opportunities abroad. Another policy adopted in Iran to counter the emigration of elites from the country is to create facilities in the field of conscription for the top students, the winners of the final stages of the Olympiads, the top ranks of the entrance examinations, etc. This policy can also be considered as one of the weak policies adopted in this field, because firstly, female elites do not have the possibility to benefit from this facility, and this must be kept in mind that a significant part of the country's elite society is made up of women. Therefore, the mentioned plan basically cannot be a comprehensive plan. Another important point is that granting conscription facilities to the elites and passing the military period in the form of a research project not only does not prevent the elites from leaving the country, but in practice they use this facility as a good opportunity to complete the military period early. And they know it is easier to leave the country. This plan can be effective when other factors affecting the migration of elites are under the control of the government. In a situation where all factors have joined hands so that the elites find the only solution is to leave the country and emigrate; Granting conscription facilities means solving one of the elites' problems on the way out of the country. It is obvious that by solving or facilitating the problem of military service in the form of research projects, the opportunity for elites to leave will be more open. Therefore, this plan is another failed policy of the Iranian government to deal with the departure of elites from the country.

Another policy in Iran is intended to encourage doctoral students to stay in the country and do scientific work in the country: Granting a loan is under the title of special loan for doctoral students. The amount of this loan is so low that it is not as much as the regular monthly expenses of students. The effectiveness of this policy is so weak that it has not even been able to oblige doctoral students to attend universities and laboratories regularly. Checking the attendance of PhD students in universities and laboratories outside of the times when they are forced to attend classrooms shows that they do not have much desire to attend the university and laboratory unless they are forced to do so by their guidance professors. It is obvious that this policy has not and will not be successful in preventing elites from leaving the country. Unfortunately, in recent years, the policy of giving cash has been proposed and implemented as one of the prominent and big policies in Iran, which has been implemented in various forms such as giving subsidies, subsistence subsidies, etc., as if the country's officials expect this solves the country's problems by granting these items. In the continuation of this failed inflationary plan, it is the students' turn, so that by giving them loans with small amounts, the authorities expect to prevent them from leaving the country. Dependent policies based on giving loans, prizes, and money should be replaced by policies and plans in which scientific elites of the country are used in relevant fields and in key and sensitive positions. and give them the opportunity to show their abilities. Another policy adopted to counter the departure of elites from the country in Iran is the possibility of accepting elites in universities as faculty members. A simple survey shows that this policy has largely remained only a name and has not been implemented in most universities. It is Just giving formal

invitations but sometimes none of the applicants have been invited to an interview, or after being invited to an interview, their expectation to continue the recruitment and recruitment process remains fruitless.

As a result, a number of new applicants are added every year, but as there is practically no recruitment, we are witnessing an unbelievable increase in the age of faculty members, especially in Tehran universities. Academic staff members whose familiarity with the computer is sometimes the level of turning the computer on and off and the last articles they have read are years and sometimes decades ago. Sometimes we also see a severe imbalance in some calls, so that there are sometimes more than 100 applicants for a particular field of study. and what is more interesting is that in the end, usually none of them are recruited, and this cycle lasts for several years. This is being implemented by the Ministry of Science. Another point is breaking the rules of recruiting faculty members, some of which have been reported in the media at some point. Even if it is assumed that the recruitment of elites will be done in this way, considering the salaries of faculty members, this option cannot attract the elites when it is compared to foreign funds. Obviously, in such a situation, the policy of recruiting elites as faculty members will not be highly efficient. In such a situation, adopting a fair and meritocracy-based approach to attract elite young people in universities, dismantling formal calls to attract academic staff members and rejuvenating and compulsory retirement of elderly professors along with increasing the salary of this stratum can definitely help to increase the motivation of the elites to stay in the country and stop emigrating. It is obvious that in such a situation, both the scientific elites of the country find the possibility of having a life with their dignity, and the country can use the capabilities of these people for further advancement and progress. Many elites leave the country in order to gain more experience and knowledge and they have the decision of temporary migration to return to the country after acquiring more skills in their profession. But in this regard one of the most important weaknesses is the wrong policies in dealing with and interacting with the elites is that the authorities do not show any desire to communicate effectively with them.

One of the proposed ways is to establish an effective and efficient relationship with the elites so that wherever they are in the world, they can cooperate in the development of the society. It is even possible to create networks of Iranian experts abroad in relation to students who do not intend to return to the country for any reason, to attract their part-time cooperation with domestic scientific centers. it can be pointed out that what is observed in the investigation of the support of the guardian organizations in the country to the elites is the excessive focus on individualism in dealing with elites and their support. It is Among the other weaknesses of the policy of dealing with the departure of the elites in Iran. Although the elites have outstanding abilities from an individual's point of view, we must also pay attention to global experiences regarding teamwork and group work in making policies. Currently, all registered patents are in a similar and identical position and are presented mainly to obtain financial and economic benefits. But perhaps providing a laboratory to an inventor is considered a more valuable service for him. It should be noted that materialistic incentives are not the relative advantage of our country. The destined countries of immigration have far more potentials to support the elites financially. Basically the main problem of the elites is not the issue of meeting their material needs, and the issue is wrongly or partially defined in the eyes of the country's officials. This fundamental mistake has led to making wrong decisions. It is enough to mention that many elites have migrated from the country in spite of receiving these supports. The provision of educational and research incentives does not have a specific goal in order to manage and use the elites optimally. Another obvious weakness is the way the government supports the elites to reduce their migration rate.

What is stated in the regulations related to elites and inventors in government organizations, including the National Foundation of Elites, Kharazmi Youth Festival, Kharazmi International Festival, Scientific and Industrial Research Organization and similar organizations. The only financial support or privilege to enter the university without the entrance exam is for the elite. It should be said that there is no proper coordination between governmental and non-governmental organizations in this field in the phase of identifying and evaluating designs and inventions and in the phase of awarding points. This has made it impossible to properly identify the country's real elites and support them. Before the establishment of the National Elite Foundation, one of the most important problems of the country was the high number of centers active in the field of elites. After the formation of the foundation, it was expected that the foundation would be in charge of organizing the responsible institutions and clearly dividing the work between them. But instead of playing the role of a headquarters, the National Foundation of Elites has become one of the elements of the line of support for the elites. It seems that the main problem of the elites in the country, regardless of whether the elites go abroad or not, is the difficulty of having them influence in the country's progress. In short, the absence of migration of elites should be sought in facilitating the possibility of their impact on the development of the country.

4. CONCLUSION

One of the most important weaknesses of the policy in Iran for the departure of the elites is the limited financial support, which is not enough to encourage the elites to stay inside the country. Granting conscription facilities does not include half of the target society, namely women, and on the other hand, not only does it not help to prevent elites from leaving the country, but it also facilitates this process. The lack of meritocracy, formal invitations and lack of recruiting elites in universities is another weakness in the existing policies. Focusing too much on individualism in dealing with elites and supporting them, paying money instead of providing facilities such as laboratories, and having problems of supporting projects in identifying and evaluating projects, as well as the way of awarding points are also other weaknesses. It is considered the most important policies in preventing elites from leaving the country. The scope of the problems of the elites in Iran is far beyond the fact that these problems can be easily solved by awarding awards, conscription facilities, etc. the conditions is provided for this class is not good enough for them to prefer staying in the country to emigrating. The issue of immigration is a function of the economic, social, political and security conditions of the country, and in recent years, economic image has become more important than other factors. Therefore, as the increase in elite immigration rate is rooted in economic and social issues, in the first step, the general economic conditions of the country should be improved and a more stable atmosphere should prevail over it. In the next step, adopting policies to create employment and give special facilities to the elites can be efficient, provided that the many problems in the implementation of these policies are also resolved. In the current situation, economic instability, increasing inflation and lack of psychological security and hope for the future, adopting supportive policies, especially with limited resources, may have opposite results and results in increase the rate of elite youth leaving the country. Creating a suitable ecosystem and environment and developing specialized capacities and providing cultural, economic, welfare, political, managerial, legal, technical and ethical infrastructures is a fundamental policy that must be pursued by the responsible institutions. The results of the solutions presented in the studies show that in order to achieve this goal, maintaining and promoting the dignity of the elites, restoring and rebuilding the atmosphere of trust between the elites, society and the government, creating an effective demand and market for the services of the elites, developing the consumption and application of science, creating the independence of scientific institutions and examples. Considering the non-material aspect of attracting elites is worth paying more attention. A more radical solution is to cure underdevelopment and form a balanced development with the character of sustainability. Giving depth to national values and building identity among the scientific elites and the general society, and making management reforms in order to strengthen the social and job attractions in the country, reduce the existing repulsions and create the infrastructure of the innovation ecosystem, pay special attention to the well-being and livelihood of the elites. It is also important to try to achieve a suitable scientific position. research and technology, strengthen the process of brain rotation through the development of scientific communication and international mobility of scientists, establish and develop scientific networks of immigrants, reform policies and laws and regulations, drafting protective laws to strengthen the social capital of immigrant elites and reject the purely security perspective in this effective field.

REFERENCE

1. Bozorg zadeh, Saeedeh and Kazemipour, Shahla and Ali Mohseni, Reza, 2019, investigation of socio-economic factors affecting the degree of elites' tendency to migrate abroad, *Quarterly Journal of Strategic Studies of Sports and Youth*, Volume 19, Number 48.
2. Bozorg zadeh, Saeedeh, 1401, study of the underlying factors of the migration of elites abroad, the second conference of social sciences, psychology, educational sciences and humanities.
3. Malekshahi, Hojatullah and Waez, Nafiseh and Taghipour, Faezeh, 1400, Pathology of the Islamic Republic of Iran's policies to curb elite immigration, *Iranian Political Sociology Quarterly*, Volume 4, Nu
4. Esmaelzadeh, A. A., & Zaker Salehi, G. R. (2015). A Study on Iranian Elite Migration. *Strategic Studies on Youth ans Sports*, 13(26), 109-130.
5. Azadi, P., Mirramezani, M., & Mesgaran, M. B. (2020). Migration and brain drain from Iran. *Stanford Iran*, 2040, 1-30.
6. BAGHERI, H., Qavam, S. M., & Haseli, G. (2019). Identifying and prioritizing factors affecting immigration of elite athletes in Iran.
7. Sadeghinezhad, M., & Mazloun Khorasani, M. (2018). Scientific Elites' Attitude to Future Career in Iran and Its Effect on Tendency to Migration. *Quarterly Journal of Social Development (Previously Human Development)*, 12(3), 1-28.
8. Shabani, F., Parizad, R., & Amini, A. (2021). Study of research factors in the migration of elites in Iran during the years 1368-1392. *Political Science Quarterly*, 16(53), 57-78.
9. Vahabi, N. (2016). The Origin of the Different Waves of Iranian Migration in France. *Journal of Cultural and Religious Studies*, 4, 2328-2177.